

Christopher Columbus and the Confederate Generals versus Native Peoples? The struggle of memories amid removal, replacement and resignification of their monuments

Luciano Gallinari

(CNR - Istituto di Storia dell'Europa Mediterranea)

Date of receipt: 19th November 2020

Date of acceptance: 30th December 2020

9. Sources

Ansorena, Javier (2018) "'Genocida" y "pedófilo": Colón, enemigo público número uno del revisionismo', *ABC*, 22 November, <https://www.abc.es/cultura/abci-genocida-y-pedofilo-colon-enemigo-publico-numero-revisionismo-201811180112_noticia.html>

Avila, Pamela (2018) 'Downtown L.A.'s Christopher Columbus Statue Is Being Removed for Good', *Los Angeles Magazine*, 9 November, <<https://www.lamag.com/citythinkblog/los-angeles-columbus-statue/>> (17 April 2020)

'Argentina, rimossa statua di Colombo. La vicenda dello spostamento' (2013) *La Stampa*, 29 June, <<https://www.lastampa.it/esteri/2013/06/29/news/argentina-rimossa-statua-di-colombo-1.36089512>>

'Argentina: schiaffo agli italiani, rimossa statua di Colombo' (2013) *La Repubblica.it*, 30 June, <<https://www.repubblica.it/ultimora/24ore/argentina-schiaffo-agli-italiani-rimossa-statua-di-colombo/news-dettaglio/4366372>>.

Baker, Ross K. (2017) 'After you remove all the Christopher Columbus statues, what good will it do?', *USA Today*, 9 October, <<https://eu.usatoday.com/story/opinion/2017/10/09/after-you-remove-all-confederate-statues-what-good-will-we-have-done-ross-baker-column/744577001/>>.

Brown, Nicole (2019) 'Statue of Elizabeth Stanton, Susan B. Anthony, Sojourner Truth at center of public hearing', *AMNY*, October, <<https://www.amny.com/news/central-park-statue-women-1-36270278/>>.

- 'Buenos Aires, rimossa la statua di Colombo. "Va restaurata". Ma gli italiani insorgono' (2013) *Corriere della Sera*, 30 June, <https://www.corriere.it/esteri/13_giugno_30/argentina-statua-colombo-rimossa_2aa54082-e12a-11e2-aa9b-d132be5871d0.shtml> (6 April 2020).
- 'Buenos Aires, rimosso il monumento a Cristoforo Colombo' (2013) *Il Giornale.it*, 30 June, <https://www.ilgiornale.it/news/esteri/buenos-aires-rimosso-monumento-cristoforo-colombo-931805.html> (6 April 2020).
- Casadei, Rodolfo (2017) 'Uccidere i padri. L'Occidente ha perso la testa', *Tempi*, 18 September, <<https://www.tempi.it/uccidere-i-padri/>> (6 April 2020).
- Colombi, Valentina (2017) 'La "guerra delle statue" in USA', *Fondazione Giangiacomo Feltrinelli*, 11 September, <<http://fondazionefeltrinelli.it/la-guerra-delle-statue-in-usa/>> (26 March 2020).
- 'Confirman que el monumento a Colón se muda a Mar del Plata' (2013), *Clarín*, 22 March, <https://www.clarin.com/ciudades/confirman-monumento-colon-mar-plata_0_r1Q1yqiw7l.html> (26 March 2020).
- 'Cristina Kirchner retira la estatua de Colón en Buenos Aires' (2013), *ABC Internacional*, 1st July, <<https://www.abc.es/internacional/20130701/abci-cristina-kirchner-retira-estatua-201307011015.html?ref=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.google.com%2F>> (01 April 2020).
- 'Cristoforo Colombo non si tocca' (2013) *La Stampa*, 5 June, <<https://www.lastampa.it/esteri/2013/06/05/news/cristoforo-colombo-non-si-tocca-1.36081158>> (01 April 2020).
- 'Críticas por la remoción de la estatua de Colón' (2013), *La Voz*, 1st July, <<https://www.lavoz.com.ar/noticias/politica/criticas-remocion-estatua-colon>> (01 April 2020).
- Davies, Pascale (2018) 'Los Angeles topples its Christopher Columbus statue', *Euronews*, 11 November, <<https://www.euronews.com/2018/11/12/los-angeles-topples-its-christopher-columbus-statue>> (01 April 2020).
- DeCarlo, Peter - Harper, Mattie (2018) 'Minnesota, we need to talk about our Columbus monument', *MinnPost*, 8 October, <<https://www.minnpost.com/perspectives/2018/10/minnesota-we-need-to-talk-about-our-columbus-monument/>> (01 April 2020).
- 'El monumento de Juana Azurduy ya está frente al Centro Cultural Kirchner' (2017), *La Nación*, 16 September, <<https://www.lanacion.com.ar/buenos-aires/trasladan-el-monumento-de-juana-azurduy-a-la-plaza-del-correo-nid2063612>> (02 April 2020).

- Fry, Hannah (2019) 'Christopher Columbus statue in San Francisco doused in red paint ahead of federal holiday', *Los Angeles Times*, 14 October, <<https://www.latimes.com/california/story/2019-10-14/christopher-columbus-statue-san-francisco-red-paint-federal-holiday>> (17 April 2020).
- Giardinelli, Mempo (2013) '¡No lo toquen a Colón!', *Página 12*, 4 April, <<https://www.pagina12.com.ar/diario/sociedad/3-217266-2013-04-04.html>> (02 April 2020).
- Gnecco, Giuliano (2017) 'Gli Stati Uniti "ripudiano" Colombo: "La statua va rimossa"', *Il Secolo XIX*, 24 August, <<https://www.ilsecoloxix.it/mondo/2017/08/24/news/gli-stati-uniti-ripudiano-colombo-la-statua-va-rimossa-1.30861921>> (7 April 2020).
- Gómez, Silvia (2017) 'A dos años del polémico traslado de la de Colón. Sigue la danza de estatuas: mudarán la de Juana Azurduy y no quedará ninguna tras la Casa Rosada', *Clarín*, 13 September, <https://www.clarin.com/ciudades/sigue-danza-estatuas-mudaran-juana-azurduy-queda-casa-rosada_0_rki_o4wc.html> (02 April 2020).
- Graff, Amy (2018) 'San Jose to remove Christopher Columbus statue within 6 weeks', *SFGATE*, 31st January, <<https://www.sfgate.com/bayarea/article/San-Jose-Christopher-Columbus-statue-remove-vote-12539846.php>> (10 April 2020)
- 'Guerra delle statue, vandalizzati monumenti di Colombo a New York' (2017), *La Stampa*, 1st September, <<https://www.lastampa.it/esteri/2017/09/01/news/guerra-delle-statue-vandalizzati-monumenti-di-colombo-a-new-york-1.34412413>> (7 April 2020).
- Maggi, Glauco (2019) 'Cristoforo Colombo nel mirino delle critiche? Soltanto la più cieca ignoranza può celare la realtà storica', *Libero. Quotidiano.it*, 18 October, <<https://www.liberoquotidiano.it/blog/glauco-maggi/13515840/cristo-foro-colombo-glauco-maggi-ignoranza-realta-storica-critiche.html>> (7 April 2020).
- Manzo, Paolo (2013) 'Cristoforo Colombo non si tocca', *La Stampa*, 5 June, <<https://www.lastampa.it/esteri/2013/06/05/news/cristoforo-colombo-non-si-tocca-1.36081158>> (7 April 2020).
- Marinelli, Andrea (2017) 'Usa, perché nella guerra delle statue nel mirino ora c'è Cristoforo Colombo', *Corriere della Sera*, 23 August, <https://www.corriere.it/esteri/17_agosto_23/usa-perche-guerra-statue-nuovo>

-obietivo-cristoforo-colombo-b48c65a2-8813-11e7-a960-ee4515521d95.shtml>
(7 April 2020).

Marsh, Julia (2019) 'City commissioner: Replace male statues in Central Park with women', *New York Post*, 16 September, <<https://nypost.com/2019/09/16/city-commissioner-replace-male-statues-in-central-park-with-women/>> (21 April 2020).

Mc Dermott, Jim (2017) 'Goodbye Columbus Day? Why Italian-Americans deserve a better holiday', *America. The Jesuit Review*, 6 October, <<https://www.americamagazine.org/politics-society/2017/10/06/goodbye-columbus-day-why-italian-americans-deserve-better-holiday>> (7 April 2020)

Mejia, Virginia (2019) 'Colón. Lo declaran Monumento Histórico Nacional y ya no podrá ser mudado', *La Nación*, 17 November, <<https://www.lanacion.com.ar/buenos-aires/colon-lo-declaran-monumento-historico-nacional-no-nid2307263>> (7 April 2020).

Miller, Chelsea R. (2018) 'Thoughts on Columbus, Italian American History, and Solidarity', *Public Humanist*, 8 October, <<https://publichumanist.com/2018/10/08/solidarity/>> (21 April 2020).

Morales, Manuel (2018) '¿Fue Colón un genocida?', *El País*, 13 November, <https://elpais.com/cultura/2018/11/12/actualidad/1542050820_331031.html> (21 April 2020).

Mur, Robert (2015) 'La mariscala venció al almirante', *La Vanguardia*, 17 July, <<https://www.pressreader.com/spain/la-vanguardia/20150717/281590944248496>> (21 April 2020).

Neuman, William (2018) 'No Traveling for New York's Columbus Statue, Mayor Decides', *The New York Times*, 12 January, <<https://www.nytimes.com/2018/01/12/nyregion/no-traveling-for-columbus-statue-mayor-de-blasio-decides.html>> (10 April 2020).

'New York mayor considers Christopher Columbus statue removal' (2017), *The Guardian*, 27 August, <<https://www.theguardian.com/us-news/2017/aug/25/new-york-christopher-columbus-statue-de-blasio>> (10 April 2020).

Parera, Lucas (2013) 'Retiraron la figura de Cristóbal Colón del monumento', *La Nación*, 29 June, <<https://www.lanacion.com.ar/buenos-aires/estandesmontando-la-estatua-a-cristobal-colon-nid1596704>> (26 March 2020).

Polledo, Carmen (2013) 'Reflexiones sobre la batalla "cultural" Cristóbal Colón/Juana Azurduy', *LaPolíticaOnline*, 5 June <<https://www.lapoliticaonline.com/nota/columna-748/>> (10 April 2020).

- Pozzi, Sandro (2017) 'La escalada racista en EE UU salpica a la estatua de Colón de Nueva York', *El País*, 25 August, <https://elpais.com/internacional/2017/08/24/universo_trump/1503605252_457207.html> (10 April 2020).
- Rebossio, Alejandro (2015) 'Una estatua de una revolucionaria reemplaza en Buenos Aires a otra del genovés', *El País*, 16 July, <https://elpais.com/internacional/2015/07/16/actualidad/1437009101_854863.html> (10 April 2020).
- 'Reemplazo de estatua de Cristóbal Colón causa polémica en Argentina' (2013), *El Universo*, 1st June, <<https://www.eluniverso.com/noticias/2013/06/01/nota/978646/reemplazo-es-tatua-cristobal-colon-causa-polemica-argentina>> (10 April 2020).
- 'Reubican en Buenos Aires polémica estatua de Cristóbal Colón' (2017), *La Vanguardia*, 9 November, <<https://www.lavanguardia.com/vida/20171109/432749602563/reubican-en-buenos-aires-polemica-estatua-de-cristobal-colon.html>> (10 April 2020).
- Riccardi, Katia (2017) 'Usa, la guerra delle statue: decapitato busto di Colombo a New York. L.A. abolisce il Columbus Day', *La Repubblica*, 1st September, <https://www.repubblica.it/esteri/2017/09/01/news/columbus_day_abolizione_usa-174350125/> (7 April 2020).
- Shen, Fern (2017) 'Columbus statue in Baltimore vandalized', *The Baltimore Brew*, 21 August, <<https://www.baltimorebrew.com/2017/08/21/columbus-statue-in-baltimore-vandalized/>> (10 April 2020).
- Small, Zachary (2019) 'Controversial Monument to Women's Suffrage Redesign to Include Sojourner Truth', *Hypoallergic*, 13 August, <<https://hyperallergic.com/513303/controversial-monument-to-womens-suffrage-redesigned-to-include-sojourner-truth/>> (10 April 2020).
- 'Sojourner Truth monument to honor abolitionist, suffragette' (2019), *APNEWS*, 12 March, <<https://apnews.com/7848bbaa237b4604b36c30b50960017b>> (10 April 2020).
- Stepman, Jarrett (2017) 'How a Radical Left-Wing Historian Birthed the Anti-Columbus Crusade', *The Daily Signal*, 25 September, <https://www.dailysignal.com/2017/09/25/radical-left-wing-historian-birthed-anti-columbus-crusade/?_ga=2.113111492.153675766.1586528348-1126107287.1586528348> (10 April 2020).

- (2017b) 'The Truth About Columbus', *The Daily Signal*, 6 October, <https://www.dailysignal.com/2017/10/06/the-truth-about-columbus/?_ga=2.112181060.153675766.1586528348-1126107287.1586528348> (10 April 2020).
 - (2018) 'What We Lose When We Take Down Statues of Men Like Columbus', *The Daily Signal*, 1st February, <https://www.dailysignal.com/2018/02/01/san-jose-caves-to-iconoclasm-will-remove-columbus-statue-from-city-hall/#dear_reader> (11 April 2020).
 - (2019) 'DC Is Abolishing Columbus Day. Here's the Truth About Columbus', *The Daily Signal*, 9 October, <<https://www.dailysignal.com/2019/10/09/dc-is-abolishing-columbus-day-heres-the-truth-about-columbus/>> (11 April 2020).
- Stone, Ken (2019) 'Columbus 'Like Hitler': American Indians Demand Removal of Chula Vista Statue', *Times of San Diego*, 12 October, <<https://timesofsandiego.com/life/2019/10/12/columbus-like-hitler-american-indians-demand-removal-of-chula-vista-statue/>> (21 April 2020).
- Sutton, Benjamin (2017) 'Over 120 Prominent Artists and Scholars Call on NYC to Take Down Racist Monuments', *Hyperallergic*, 1st September, <<https://hyperallergic.com/414315/over-120-prominent-artists-and-scholars-call-on-nyc-to-take-down-racist-monuments/>> (11 April 2020).
- Taffa, Deborah (2018) 'Columbus Day is A Monument To White Supremacy', *HuffPost*, 8 October, <https://www.huffpost.com/entry/opinion-columbus-indigenous-peoples_n_5bb7e166e4b0876eda9e3061?guccounter=1> (21 April 2020).
- Taylor Hayes, Kelly (2019) "'Stop celebrating genocide": Christopher Columbus statues vandalized in California, Rhode Island', *FOX11*, 14 October, <<https://www.foxla.com/news/stop-celebrating-genocide-christopher-columbus-statues-vandalized-in-california-rhode-island>> (21 April 2020).
- Torrez, Yuri (2013) 'Cuando la insurgencia simbólica hurga el avispero', *Opinión. Diario de circulación nacional*, 14 July, <<https://www.opinion.com.bo/articulo/ramona/cuando-insurgencia-simbolica-hurga-avispero/20130714232900663637.html>> (27 March 2020).
- 'Tras años de conflicto, Cristóbal Colón vuelve a mirar a Europa' (2017), *El País*, 8 November, <https://elpais.com/internacional/2017/11/08/argentina/1510162393_610131.html> (27 March 2020).
- 'Tras años de polémica, removieron la estatua de Juana Azurduy que estaba detrás de la Casa Rosada' (2017), *Infobae*, 16 September, <<https://www.infobae.com/sociedad/2017/09/16/tras-anos-de-polemica-remo>

vieron-la-estatua-de-juana-azurduy-que-estaba-detras-de-la-casa-rosada/> (27 March 2020).

Vanasco, Jennifer (2017) 'The Complicated History of the Christopher Columbus Statue', *WNYC*, 5 December, <<https://www.wnyc.org/story/complicated-history-christopher-columbus-statue/>> (15 April 2020).

Verde, Simone (2017) 'Con la rimozione delle statue l'America ricusa se stessa', *Il Fatto Quotidiano*, 28 August, <<https://www.ilfattoquotidiano.it/in-edicola/articoli/2017/08/28/con-la-rimozione-delle-statue-lamerica-ricusa-se-stessa/3821193/>> (27 March 2020).

Viola, John M. (2017) 'Tearing Down Statues of Columbus Also Tears Down My History', *The New York Times*, 9 October, <<https://www.nytimes.com/2017/10/09/opinion/christopher-columbus-day-statue.html>> (8 April 2020).

Zorthian, Julia (2017) 'President Trump Says It's "Sad" to See U.S. Culture "Ripped Apart" by removing Confederate Statues', *Time*, 17 August, <<http://time.com/4904510/donald-trump-twitter-confederate-statues/>> (8 April 2020).

10. References

- Assmann, Aleida (2002) *Ricordare. Forme e mutamenti della memoria culturale*. Bologna: Il Mulino.
- Bartlett, Frederic C. (1932) *Remembering: A Study in Experimental and Social Psychology*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Bertagna, Federica (2009) *La Stampa italiana in Argentina*. Roma: Donzelli.
- Bloch, Maurice (1996) 'Internal and external memory: different ways to be in history', in Paul Antze - Michael Lambek (eds.) *Tense Past. Cultural Essays in Trauma and Memory*. New York - London: Routledge, pp. 67-85.
- Bodnar, John E. (1992) *Remaking America. Public Memory, Commemoration, and Patriotism in the Twentieth Century*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Chakrabarty Dipesh (1998) 'Minority histories, subaltern pasts', *Postcolonial Studies*, Vol. 1, No 1, pp 15-29.
- Dei, Fabio (2004) 'Antropologia e memoria. Prospettive di un nuovo rapporto con la storia', *Novecento*, 10, pp. 27-46.

- Fontana, Laura Maria (2010) 'Memoria, trasmissione e verità storica', *Rivista di Estetica*, 45, pp. 91-112.
- Gillis, John R. (1994) 'Memory and identity: The history of a relationship', in John R. Gillis (ed.) *Commemorations. The Politics of National Identity*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Guixé Coromines, Jordi - Ricart Ulldemolins, Núria (2020) 'A López y López. Quinto asalto. Memorias incómodas en el espacio público', *RiMe. Rivista dell'Istituto di Storia dell'Europa Mediterranea*, 7 (II) n.s., dicembre 2020, pp. 139-167.
- Guzzi, Diego (2011) 'Per una definizione di memoria pubblica. Halbwachs, Ricoeur, Assmann, Margalit', *Scienza & Politica*, 44, pp. 27-39.
- Halbwachs, Maurice (1997) *I quadri sociali della memoria*. Napoli: Ipermedium.
- Habermas, Jürgen (2008) *L'inclusione dell'altro. Studi di teoria politica*. A cura di Leonardo Ceppa. Milano: Feltrinelli.
- Hobsbawm, Eric J. - Ranger, Terence (a cura di) (1987) *L'invenzione della tradizione*. Torino: Einaudi.
- Jedlowski, Paolo (1996) 'Introduzione', in Maurice Halbwachs, *La memoria collettiva*, trad. it. Milano: Unicopli.
- (2001) 'Memory and Sociology. Themes and issues', *Time & Society*, 10 (1, March), pp. 29-49.
- Jiménez Frei, Cheryl (2019) 'Columbus, Juana and the Politics of the Plaza: Battles over Monuments, Memory and Identity in Buenos Aires', *Journal of Latin American Studies*, 51, pp. 607-638.
- Klein, Stanley B. - Nichols, Shaun (2012), 'Memory and the Sense of Personal Identity', *Mind*, 121 (483, July), pp. 677-702.
- Knuuttila, Simo (2012) 'The emotion of shame in Medieval philosophy', *Spazio Filosofico*, pp. 243-249.
- Maier, Charles (1995) 'Un eccesso di memoria? Riflessioni sulla storia, la malinconia e la negazione', *Parolechiave*, 9, December.
- Musarra, Antonio (2018) *Processo a Colombo. Scoperta o sterminio?* Viareggio: Edizioni La Vela.
- Taylor, Charles (2008) 'La politica del riconoscimento', in Habermas, Jürgen - Taylor, Charles, *Multiculturalismo. Lotte per il riconoscimento*. Milano: Feltrinelli, 2008, pp. 9-62.

- Taylor, Gabriele (1985) *Pride, Shame and Guilt: Emotions of Self-Assessment*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Tonkin, Elizabeth (2000) *Raccontare il nostro passato. La costruzione sociale della storia orale*. Roma: Armando.
- Tracy, Jessica L. - Price Tangney, June - Robins, Richard W. (eds.) (2007) *The Self-Conscious Emotions: Theory and Research*. New York: Guilford.
- Traverso, Enzo (2002) *La violenza nazista. Una genealogia*. Bologna: Il Mulino.
- (2006) *Il passato: istruzioni per l'uso. Storia, memoria, politica*. Verona: Ombre Corte.
- Wettlaufer, Jörg (2015) 'The shame game. Moral emotions have long been used to change people's behaviour, but is shaming still relevant in modern society?', *RSA Journal*, 161, No. 5564, pp. 36-39.
- Zerubavel, Eviatar (2005) *Mappe del tempo. Memoria collettiva e costruzione sociale del passato*. Bologna: Il Mulino.